**ST Meeting #56 – 12/12/2023**

**Participants:**  
Nico Diaz   
Jason Scharf  
Chief Tim Gleeson  
Johannes Himmelreich  
Michelle Sczpanski  
Jennifer Tifft  
Val Didamo   
Mark King  
Bradford Morse  
1st Deputy Chief Shoff  
Dr. Martha Grabowski  
  
**Absent**  
Daniel Schwarz (Excused)  
Deputy Mayor Sharon Owens  
Ocesa Keaton  
  
**Agenda/Notes:**

* Automated Speed & Redlight Enforcement Technologies
  + Reviewed the question-and-answer document that folks have already submitted to Neil.
  + Opened this up for Q & A
  + Bradford asked if they are modeling this after any other city.
    - Neil stated that they have been looking at what NYC has been doing (very well documented). Also stated that they looked at Albany and Rochester.
    - When asked if Albany and Rochester were still operating these programs, Neil stated that Albany is, but Rochester is not.
    - When asked why, he stated that public perception about this
    - Albany was Red-light. Rochester was speed based. Buffalo was a mix, of stop-arm cameras, red-light cameras. NYC had all three.
    - Jen T. asked if they have had any outreach to SCSD schools.
      * Neil stated that they have met a lot with New York Council of Mayors (NYCOM), who has had a lot of contact with school districts.
      * Neil stated that bus-control arm cameras are very popular.
      * NYCOM will have continued contact with the schools.
    - Johannes asked about Neil and DPW’s approach to data minimization.
      * Neil stated that they only want the minimum amount of data necessary. Edge processing sends he information to the NYS DMV. He stated that this does have to reviewed by a police officer.
    - Johannes stated that some cities have looked at face blurring and asked if Syracuse has looked at this.
      * Neil stated that thy have not, but he was open to this, stating that they don’t care who was driving the car, they are only going to be ticketing the registered owner of the car.
    - Nicolas asked about cases where a car was not speeding or running a red light, how long is this data stored for.
      * Neil stated that whatever the minimum amount of storing this information is, they would like to keep it for that.
    - Bradford asked if any suburbs are looking at pursuing this technology.
      * Neil stated that he does not know any that have pursued this yet, but that some vendors have been reaching out to them.
      * He stated that Onondaga County has been looking into this, but that this has not gone anywhere yet.
    - Martha asked about if they are going to do a pilot of certain areas first or phase?
      * Neil stated that they were not looking at doing a pilot but are looking to implement this in phases.
      * Neil stated that they are looking to roll these out to High Schools first. Due the the fact that these have more walkers and there are less of them in the city.
      * Neil stated that they are partnering with SCSD, and that they are taking input from them on prioritization also.
    - Bradford asked how long some of these implementations have been going for.
      * Neil stated that NYC has had this going for approximately a decade. Albany is a few years, Rochester was a few years old, same with Buffalo. Syracuse started down this path with bus-arm cameras.
      * Neil stated that they believe that the technology and the offerings have improved.
    - Jason S. asked about what information is captured.
      * Neil stated that most of them use Lidar, and that they are mostly picture based data, will have a still image of that license plate.
    - Nico asked about signs and signals for this technology.
      * Neil stated that there is requirements that there is “very conspicuous signage”, before it starts, what the speed limit is, this school zone is enforced with camera technology. Neil stated that this signage would be florescent also.
    - Nico also asked if he has an image of this signage he could share with the group, and Neil said that he does.
    - Nico asked if this would display the speed of the driver.
      * Neil stated that those are bus-feedback devices, but these devices would not include those signs.
    - Nico asked about the bus-arm camera’s and how signage would be posted for this.
      * Neil stated that this is more difficult on school buses, and that is why they are doing the press releases for this technology.
    - Johannaes asked about if technology image blurring would be part of the vendor selection.
      * Nico stated that he is part of the RFP committee and could try to work on that.
    - The group did not have any further questions and Neil then left the meeting.
    - The group had some discussion about this.
      * Martha stated that the Governor just released a similar system for speeding in work zones.
      * Jason asked about possibly having some sort of signage on buses.
        + Jen stated that signage on buses is controlled by NYS Education department.
      * Chief Shoff mentioned that for speed limits they don’t put these around the entire city, but rather at periodic entry points to roads.
      * Bradford mentioned that or even awareness ads... for prevention
      * Mark asked about if this would be subject to the same, three speeding tickets in a time period losing their license rules.
        + Chief Shoff stated that this would be more treated like a parking ticket and would most likely not follow that same rule.
      * Martha posted: Work Zone Speed Enforcement program: <https://www.syracuse.com/state/2023/12/nys-new-automated-speeding-radars-have-issued-over-130000-tickets-so-far.html?outputType=amp>
      * Johannes posted: The work zone automatic enforcement is I think implementing a law from 2021 <https://www.nysenate.gov/legislation/laws/VAT/1180-E>
      * One of the very few state laws that I could find on this (since it’s an exception for surveillance tech in the mayors EO if a city dept implements state law)
* Status of the Citywide Audit & Inventory
  + This has been shared on the Syr.gov website
  + Jason S. was requested to reach out to Comms (Brooke & Ruthnie) regarding this
* Destiny USA ALPR's
* Coming Up
* Questions

**Previous Action Items:**

* Create a Google Document with Information about Drone Technologies and potential questions that we will have for the Police Department and send to the group - [@Scharf, Jason](mailto:jscharf@syr.gov)
* Contact Joe Barry regarding potential law issues for the Bus Arm and Red Light camera’s - [@Scharf, Jason](mailto:jscharf@syr.gov)
* Gather document of questions for Neil Burke and DPW and send to the group for them to be able to add to also. - [@Scharf, Jason](mailto:jscharf@syr.gov)
* Contact comms to be able to start to draft a press release for the public comment period. - [@Scharf, Jason](mailto:jscharf@syr.gov)

**New Action Items:**

* Jason S. was requested to reach out to Comms (Brooke & Ruthnie) regarding a press release about Citywide Audit